

Score for Mesh, Erika

Intellectual Merit Criterion

Overall Assessment of Intellectual Merit

Excellent

Explanation to Applicant

The applicant's successful record as an undergraduate and MS student are strong indicators of having a solid foundation to conduct research in software engineering. The letters of recommendation also attest to the applicant's ability to conduct research and work well as part of a team and communicate effectively with a broad range of people.

Broader Impacts Criterion

Overall Assessment of Broader Impacts

Very Good

Explanation to Applicant

The applicant has chosen a research area with a clear broader impact which is discussed as part of the research plan. The applicant has demonstrated a strong commitment to quality education and research through interactions with the department, as well as a commitment to broadening opportunities through mentoring activities.

Score for Mesh, Erika

Intellectual Merit Criterion

Overall Assessment of Intellectual Merit

Very Good

Explanation to Applicant

The applicant has very good but not outstanding academic qualifications. She has performed a good amount of research, but it has not led to publications, even after completing her Master's degree. The proposed research plan is meritorious, relevant, and has high potential impact. However, the research plan lacks detail, e.g. sample project characteristics that would appear promising using grounded theory.

Broader Impacts Criterion

Overall Assessment of Broader Impacts

Good

Explanation to Applicant

Little in the applicant's proposal indicates contributions that encourage diversity and broaden citizen participation (including women and minorities) in science and research. The applicant is strong on enhancing scientific and technical understanding, but not so strong on contributions that benefit society and are communicated to a large audience.

Score for Mesh, Erika

Intellectual Merit Criterion

Overall Assessment of Intellectual Merit

Very Good

Explanation to Applicant

Very sound academics with extensive work experience. Research experience came primarily within the context of corporate return on investment leading to a pragmatic approach. However applicant still found opportunity to do research at the graduate level. Great initiative in seeking PhD fellowship after such a long absence.

Broader Impacts Criterion

Overall Assessment of Broader Impacts

Good

Explanation to Applicant

Proposed research to modernize software engineering tools and techniques will aid other researchers in their quest for discovery. Research could be more focused on solving a specific problem with more measurable return on investment. Good references, but difficult to stratify such a nontraditional candidate.